

# Lesson 9: Teacher Resource Sheet - E Pluribus Unum - Civil Discourse in Practice (Part 1 of 2)

## Discussion Topic: Cultural Adaptation vs. Preservation

### Why This Topic Works for Synthesis

**Connects to identity lessons:** Personal and cultural aspects of who we are

**Relates to integration metaphors:** Melting pot, mosaic, salad bowl applications

**Involves competing goods:** Legitimate values on multiple sides

**Requires civil discourse:** Complex issue needing respectful dialogue

**Relevant to students:** Real dilemmas they and their families navigate

### Framing the Issue for Students

**Not either/or:** Most people engage in both adaptation and preservation in different contexts

**Contextual factors:** Family settings vs. public spaces, different domains (language, food, dress, holidays)

**Individual choice:** Personal agency within family and community expectations

**Mutual responsibility:** Both cultural maintenance and bridge-building matter

### Avoiding Oversimplification

**Multiple contexts:** Same person might adapt in some situations, preserve in others

**Spectrum not binary:** Degrees of adaptation and preservation, not absolute choices

**Mutual adaptation:** Majority culture also changes through contact with minority cultures

**Systemic factors:** Individual choices occur within larger social and political contexts

## Group Formation and Assignment (Step 3 - 15 minutes)

### Pre-Class Preparation

**Determine group sizes based on class enrollment:**

- **20-24 students:** 8 Adaptation, 8 Preservation, 6-8 Moderators
- **25-30 students:** 10 Adaptation, 10 Preservation, 8-10 Moderators
- **31+ students:** Consider 12 per position group, remainder as Moderators

**Assignment method options:**

- **Random assignment:** Draw names from hat, count off by threes
- **Strategic assignment:** Balance based on personality types (mix quiet/talkative students)
- **Student choice:** Allow selection but monitor for balance

### **Room arrangement planning:**

- **Preparation phase:** Three distinct areas for group work
- **Discussion phase:** Semicircle or U-shape with Moderators at center/front

### **Group Assignment Process (First 5 minutes of Step 3)**

#### **Step 1: Announce groups and rationale**

"We're going to have structured dialogue about cultural adaptation vs. preservation. You'll be assigned to argue for a specific position - this is about practicing civil discourse skills, not your personal beliefs."

#### **Step 2: Form groups efficiently**

- **Call names by group** rather than having students move randomly
- **Designate meeting areas** clearly: "Adaptation advocates, front left corner. Preservation advocates, front right corner. Moderators, center tables."
- **Distribute role cards** or handouts specific to each group

#### **Step 3: Explain roles briefly**

- **Position groups:** "Your job is to present the strongest possible case for your assigned position"
- **Moderators:** "Your job is to help the conversation be productive and find common ground"

### **Position Development Guidelines (Remaining 10 minutes of Step 3)**

#### **Adaptation Advocates - Key Arguments to Guide**

##### **Building bridges and connections:**

- Creates opportunities for cross-cultural friendship and understanding
- Reduces barriers to social and economic participation
- Helps newcomers feel welcomed and included in broader community

##### **Practical benefits:**

- Career and educational opportunities
- Social acceptance and reduced discrimination
- Easier navigation of mainstream institutions

##### **Flexibility as strength:**

- Adaptability is valuable character strength
- Shows respect for new community's norms
- Demonstrates openness and learning orientation

#### **Historical examples:**

- Successful integration stories throughout American history
- Innovation and creativity from cultural blending
- Shared traditions that emerged from cultural exchange

### **Preservation Advocates - Key Arguments to Guide**

#### **Maintaining authentic identity:**

- Psychological benefits of staying true to heritage
- Important for self-esteem and mental health
- Prevents loss of unique cultural wisdom and practices

#### **Cultural continuity and heritage:**

- Responsibility to preserve traditions for future generations
- Rich cultural practices that enrich broader society
- Historical memory and family/community connections

#### **Diversity benefits:**

- Different perspectives and approaches benefit everyone
- Cultural practices that address universal human needs
- Innovation comes from maintaining diverse approaches

#### **Resistance to pressure:**

- Courage to maintain identity despite social pressure
- Challenging unjust expectations for cultural conformity
- Preserving space for multiple ways of being American

### **Moderator/Synthesizer Group - Key Considerations**

#### **Contextual factors:**

- Different domains (language, food, dress, holidays) might call for different approaches
- Family settings vs. public spaces require different strategies
- Generational differences in adaptation/preservation preferences

#### **Balance points:**

- Ways to express culture while being accessible to others
- Core values vs. cultural practices distinction
- Individual choice vs. community expectations navigation

#### **Creative solutions:**

- Both/and rather than either/or approaches
- Code-switching and multicultural competence
- Building bridges while maintaining roots

## **Small Group Preparation Support (Step 4 - 10 minutes)**

### **Detailed Role Guidance for Internal Organization**

#### **Adaptation Advocates - Internal Organization**

##### **Recommended roles within group:**

- **Lead presenters** (2): Opening statement and closing thoughts
- **Evidence gatherers** (2-3): Research examples and supporting details
- **Response team** (2-3): Handle questions and rebuttals
- **Steel-manning specialist** (1): Present opposing arguments fairly

##### **Preparation tasks:**

1. **Develop 3-4 main arguments** with specific examples
2. **Anticipate counterarguments** and prepare responses
3. **Practice steel-manning** the preservation position
4. **Identify values** to acknowledge in star-manning
5. **Check arguments** for logical fallacies

#### **Preservation Advocates - Internal Organization**

##### **Same role structure as Adaptation group**

##### **Additional considerations:**

- **Cultural sensitivity:** Ensure arguments don't stereotype any particular groups
- **Balance examples:** Include various cultural contexts, not just one tradition
- **Address practicality:** Acknowledge real-world challenges while maintaining position

### **Moderator/Synthesizer Group - Detailed Guidance**

**This group needs the most scaffolding as their role is most complex**

### **Specific roles within Moderator group:**

- **Discussion facilitator** (1): Manages flow, asks follow-up questions
- **Timekeeper** (1): Tracks time, signals transitions
- **Common ground identifier** (2): Listens for shared values and concerns
- **Question coordinator** (1): Manages clarifying question phase
- **Synthesis presenter** (1): Summarizes findings at end

### **Preparation tasks for Moderators:**

1. **Review both positions** thoroughly to understand key arguments
2. **Prepare transition phrases:** "Let's move to questions," "I'm hearing both sides value..."
3. **Identify potential areas of agreement:** Family importance, respect, contribution to community
4. **Prepare follow-up questions:** "Can you give a specific example?" "How might that work in practice?"
5. **Plan synthesis structure:** What format will you use to present common ground?

### **Moderator preparation questions:**

- What values do both positions seem to share?
- Where might compromise or middle ground exist?
- What questions could help clarify each side's reasoning?
- How might both approaches work in different contexts?

## **Teacher Circulation During Preparation**

### **Time allocation (10 minutes total):**

- **Minutes 1-3:** Check in with Moderator group (they need most support)
- **Minutes 4-6:** Circulate between position groups
- **Minutes 7-9:** Final check with all groups, address questions
- **Minute 10:** Transition preparation

### **Moderator Group Support Priorities**

#### **Common challenges and responses:**

- **"We don't know what to do":** Refer to specific preparation tasks list
- **"How do we moderate?":** Practice transition phrases, explain timing
- **"What if people get upset?":** Role-play gentle redirection techniques

#### **Key coaching points:**

- **Your job isn't to have opinions** on the topic, but to help others express theirs
- **Ask genuine questions** to help clarify positions

- **Look for shared values** even when positions differ
- **Keep discussion respectful** by focusing on ideas, not people

## **Position Group Support**

**For both Adaptation and Preservation groups:**

- **Check argument quality:** Are they avoiding fallacies?
- **Encourage steel-manning:** Can they fairly represent the other side?
- **Suggest specific examples:** Help them find concrete illustrations
- **Time management:** Are they dividing tasks effectively?

**Red flags to address:**

- Arguments that stereotype cultural groups
- Personal attacks or dismissive language about other position
- Over-reliance on weak or fallacious reasoning
- Failure to assign internal roles or divide tasks

## **Physical Setup and Logistics**

### **Room Arrangement**

**Preparation phase** (current lesson):

- **Clear three distinct areas** with adequate space for small group work
- **Provide materials:** Chart paper, markers, handouts for each group
- **Teacher circulation path:** Plan how you'll move between all three groups efficiently

### **Material Distribution**

**For all groups:**

- Discussion topic handout with position descriptions
- Civil Dialogue Template for note-taking
- Scratch paper for preparation notes

**Additional for Moderators:**

- List of potential synthesis questions
- Timing guide for discussion phases
- Common ground identification worksheet

## **Civil Discourse Integration for Preparation**

## **Skills to Monitor For During Preparation**

**Steel-manning preparation:** Groups practicing fair representation of opposing arguments

**Star-manning preparation:** Identifying good intentions and values behind different positions

**Fallacy checking:** Groups reviewing their arguments for logical soundness

**Perspective-shifting:** Understanding how personal experiences influence viewpoints

**Respectful framing:** Preparing to challenge ideas while respecting persons

## **Unit Concept Connections to Emphasize**

### **Identity Complexity**

**Prompt students to connect:**

- "How does this discussion relate to your identity maps from early lessons?"
- "Which aspects of identity might be more or less adaptable?"
- "How do character strengths help navigate these choices?"

### **Philosophical Approaches to Racial Identity**

**Make explicit connections:**

- Different philosophical approaches might influence adaptation/preservation choices
- Same person might use different approaches in different contexts
- Understanding multiple approaches helps navigate complex decisions

### **Integration Metaphors**

**Apply previous learning:**

- "Which integration metaphor best describes each position?"
- "How might different metaphors work in different contexts?"
- "Do these metaphors capture the full complexity of the issue?"

### **Pluralism and Competing Goods**

**Prepare for synthesis:**

- "How does this exemplify competing goods rather than good vs. evil?"
- "What makes this a pluralistic challenge?"
- "How do democratic processes help navigate these tensions?"

## **Preparation for Tomorrow's Discussion**

## **Assignment for Tomorrow**

Students should review:

- Civil Dialogue Template Part 2
- SLEW Framework handout
- Their group's preparation work from today

## **Transition Message**

"Tomorrow we'll put all your preparation into practice with a structured civil dialogue that applies everything we've learned about respectful discourse across differences."

## **Contingency Planning**

### **If Groups Finish Preparation Early**

**Extension activities:**

- Practice steel-manning each other's arguments within the group
- Develop additional examples or evidence
- Prepare questions they'd like to ask the other side

### **If Groups Need More Preparation Time**

**Adjustment strategies:**

- Allow first 10 minutes of tomorrow's lesson for final preparation
- Have groups identify their strongest 2-3 arguments to focus on
- Emphasize quality over quantity of arguments

## **Managing Resistance to Assigned Positions**

**If students object to their assigned position:**

- Remind them this is about practicing skills, not expressing personal beliefs
- Emphasize that understanding multiple perspectives is a valuable skill
- Note that they may discover insights about positions they hadn't considered
- Frame as intellectual challenge and character development opportunity

## **Lesson 9: E Pluribus Unum - Civil Discourse in Practice (Unit Wrap-Up)**

# Teacher Resource Sheet

---

## Discussion Topic: Cultural Adaptation vs. Preservation

### Why This Topic Works for Synthesis

**Connects to identity lessons:** Personal and cultural aspects of who we are

**Relates to integration metaphors:** Melting pot, mosaic, salad bowl applications

**Involves competing goods:** Legitimate values on multiple sides

**Requires civil discourse:** Complex issue needing respectful dialogue

**Relevant to students:** Real dilemmas they and their families navigate

### Framing the Issue

**Not either/or:** Most people engage in both adaptation and preservation in different contexts

**Contextual factors:** Family settings vs. public spaces, different domains (language, food, dress, holidays)

**Individual choice:** Personal agency within family and community expectations

**Mutual responsibility:** Both cultural maintenance and bridge-building matter

### Avoiding Oversimplification

**Multiple contexts:** Same person might adapt in some situations, preserve in others

**Spectrum not binary:** Degrees of adaptation and preservation, not absolute choices

**Mutual adaptation:** Majority culture also changes through contact with minority cultures

**Systemic factors:** Individual choices occur within larger social and political contexts

---

## Group Preparation Guidelines

### Adaptation Advocates - Key Arguments

#### Building bridges and connections:

- Creates opportunities for cross-cultural friendship and understanding
- Reduces barriers to social and economic participation
- Helps newcomers feel welcomed and included in broader community

#### Practical benefits:

- Career and educational opportunities
- Social acceptance and reduced discrimination
- Easier navigation of mainstream institutions

#### **Flexibility as strength:**

- Adaptability is valuable character strength
- Shows respect for new community's norms
- Demonstrates openness and learning orientation

#### **Historical examples:**

- Successful integration stories throughout American history
- Innovation and creativity from cultural blending
- Shared traditions that emerged from cultural exchange

### **Preservation Advocates - Key Arguments**

#### **Maintaining authentic identity:**

- Psychological benefits of staying true to heritage
- Important for self-esteem and mental health
- Prevents loss of unique cultural wisdom and practices

#### **Cultural continuity and heritage:**

- Responsibility to preserve traditions for future generations
- Rich cultural practices that enrich broader society
- Historical memory and family/community connections

#### **Diversity benefits:**

- Different perspectives and approaches benefit everyone
- Cultural practices that address universal human needs
- Innovation comes from maintaining diverse approaches

#### **Resistance to pressure:**

- Courage to maintain identity despite social pressure
- Challenging unjust expectations for cultural conformity
- Preserving space for multiple ways of being American

### **Moderator/Synthesizer Group - Key Considerations**

#### **Contextual factors:**

- Different domains (language, food, dress, holidays) might call for different approaches
- Family settings vs. public spaces require different strategies
- Generational differences in adaptation/preservation preferences

#### **Balance points:**

- Ways to express culture while being accessible to others
- Core values vs. cultural practices distinction
- Individual choice vs. community expectations navigation

#### **Creative solutions:**

- Both/and rather than either/or approaches
- Code-switching and multicultural competence
- Building bridges while maintaining roots

---

## **Civil Discourse Integration**

### **Skills to Monitor For**

**Steel-manning:** Students presenting opposing arguments in strongest form

**Star-manning:** Acknowledging good intentions and values behind different positions

**Fallacy avoidance:** Logically sound arguments that address real issues

**Perspective-shifting:** Understanding how personal experiences influence viewpoints

**Respectful engagement:** Challenging ideas while respecting persons

### **Common Challenges and Responses**

#### **Reverting to personal experience only:**

- "That's a valuable perspective - how might it apply more broadly?"
- "Can you steel-man the other side's concern about that?"

#### **Making it about specific ethnic groups:**

- "Let's keep this about general principles rather than specific communities"
- "How might these principles apply across different cultural backgrounds?"

#### **False dichotomy thinking:**

- "Are there ways to address both concerns?"
- "What might a both/and approach look like?"

### **Getting too abstract:**

- "Can you give a concrete example of how that might work?"
  - "How have you seen this play out in real situations?"
- 

## **Synthesis and Common Ground**

### **Potential Areas of Agreement**

#### **Shared values:**

- Importance of family and community connections
- Desire for respect and acceptance
- Value of contributing to society
- Appreciation for cultural richness

#### **Common concerns:**

- Wanting to belong and feel accepted
- Maintaining important relationships
- Passing on meaningful traditions to children
- Contributing positively to community

#### **Practical solutions:**

- Context-appropriate choices
- Mutual adaptation rather than one-way assimilation
- Celebrating diversity while building unity
- Individual choice within community support

### **Questions for Finding Common Ground**

#### **Values exploration:**

- "What do both sides care about most deeply?"
- "Where do you see shared concerns or goals?"
- "How might different approaches serve similar values?"

#### **Creative problem-solving:**

- "Are there ways to honor both adaptation and preservation?"
- "What would success look like for both perspectives?"
- "How might we create communities where both approaches are valued?"

---

## Unit Concept Connections

### Identity Complexity

**Prompt students to connect:**

- "How does this discussion relate to your identity maps from early lessons?"
- "Which aspects of identity might be more or less adaptable?"
- "How do character strengths help navigate these choices?"

### Philosophical Approaches to Racial Identity

**Make explicit connections:**

- Different philosophical approaches might influence adaptation/preservation choices
- Same person might use different approaches in different contexts
- Understanding multiple approaches helps navigate complex decisions

### Integration Metaphors

**Apply previous learning:**

- "Which integration metaphor best describes each position?"
- "How might different metaphors work in different contexts?"
- "Do these metaphors capture the full complexity of the issue?"

### Pluralism and Competing Goods

**Synthesize understanding:**

- "How does this exemplify competing goods rather than good vs. evil?"
- "What makes this a pluralistic challenge?"
- "How do democratic processes help navigate these tensions?"

---

## Assessment Through Observation

### Content Understanding

**Identity concepts:** Students reference race, ethnicity, culture, character strengths appropriately

**Philosophical sophistication:** Recognition of multiple valid approaches to identity questions

**Pluralism application:** Understanding of competing goods and democratic participation  
**Integration awareness:** Sophisticated understanding of cultural navigation challenges

## Skill Development

**Civil discourse techniques:** Effective use of steel-manning, star-manning, respectful disagreement  
**Logical reasoning:** Arguments free from major fallacies, addressing strongest opposing points  
**Perspective-taking:** Understanding how different experiences lead to different viewpoints  
**Common ground identification:** Finding shared values and potential synthesis points

## Preparation for Future Learning

**Democratic participation:** Skills for engaging in civic discussions  
**Cross-cultural competence:** Ability to navigate diverse communities respectfully  
**Critical thinking:** Analyzing complex social issues with nuance  
**Character development:** Applying virtues to challenging interpersonal situations

---

## Reflection and Closure

### Individual Reflection Prompts

**Identity evolution:** "How has your understanding of identity (your own and others') evolved through this unit?"  
**Skill development:** "Which civil discourse skill was most valuable today and how might you apply it outside school?"  
**Character growth:** "Which character strength do you want to develop further based on today's discussion?"

### Unit Synthesis Questions

**E Pluribus Unum:** "How do individual identities contribute to shared American identity?"  
**Democratic participation:** "What role do civil discourse skills play in making democracy work?"  
**Personal application:** "How will you use what you've learned in future conversations about difficult topics?"

### Homework Reflection Structure

**Comprehensive synthesis:** 2-page reflection addressing identity evolution, skill development, and character growth  
**Specific application:** Concrete plan for developing chosen character strength  
**Forward-looking:** How learning applies to future academic and civic participation

---

## Differentiation and Support

## For Advanced Students

**Meta-analysis role:** Observe and comment on effective civil discourse techniques during discussion

**Synthesis leadership:** Help identify common ground and creative solutions

**Peer coaching:** Support classmates in applying civil discourse skills effectively

## For Struggling Students

**Focused skill practice:** Choose one civil discourse technique to focus on rather than trying all

**Concrete examples:** Provide specific sentence stems and example responses

**Partner support:** Pair with stronger students during preparation and discussion

## For Diverse Perspectives

**Cultural sensitivity:** Ensure examples don't stereotype or oversimplify any cultural experiences

**Multiple entry points:** Allow different ways to connect personal experience to broader concepts

**Validation of complexity:** Acknowledge that these issues affect different students differently

---

# Transition to Next Unit

## Skills Transfer

**Document progress:** Note individual student growth in civil discourse skills

**Celebrate development:** Acknowledge how much students have grown since beginning of unit

**Preview application:** "You'll use these same skills as we explore how American government structures handle pluralism"

## Conceptual Bridge

**From individual to institutional:** "We've learned about personal identity and interpersonal skills - next we'll see how institutions manage diversity"

**Democratic preparation:** "These skills prepare you for civic participation in diverse democracy"

**Ongoing relevance:** "You'll continue developing these abilities throughout high school and beyond"

# Group Setup and Management Tips

## Pre-Class Preparation

### Determine group sizes based on class enrollment:

- **20-24 students:** 8 Adaptation, 8 Preservation, 6-8 Moderators
- **25-30 students:** 10 Adaptation, 10 Preservation, 8-10 Moderators
- **31+ students:** Consider 12 per position group, remainder as Moderators

### Assignment method options:

- **Random assignment:** Draw names from hat, count off by threes
- **Strategic assignment:** Balance based on personality types (mix quiet/talkative students)
- **Student choice:** Allow selection but monitor for balance

### Room arrangement planning:

- **Preparation phase:** Three distinct areas for group work
- **Discussion phase:** Semicircle or U-shape with Moderators at center/front

## Group Assignment Process (5 minutes)

**Step 1: Announce groups and rationale** "We're going to have structured dialogue about cultural adaptation vs. preservation. You'll be assigned to argue for a specific position - this is about practicing civil discourse skills, not your personal beliefs."

### Step 2: Form groups efficiently

- **Call names by group** rather than having students move randomly
- **Designate meeting areas** clearly: "Adaptation advocates, front left corner. Preservation advocates, front right corner. Moderators, center tables."
- **Distribute role cards** or handouts specific to each group

### Step 3: Explain roles briefly

- **Position groups:** "Your job is to present the strongest possible case for your assigned position"
- **Moderators:** "Your job is to help the conversation be productive and find common ground"

---

## Detailed Role Guidance

## **Adaptation Advocates - Internal Organization**

### **Recommended roles within group:**

- **Lead presenters** (2): Opening statement and closing thoughts
- **Evidence gatherers** (2-3): Research examples and supporting details
- **Response team** (2-3): Handle questions and rebuttals
- **Steel-manning specialist** (1): Present opposing arguments fairly

### **Preparation tasks:**

1. **Develop 3-4 main arguments** with specific examples
2. **Anticipate counterarguments** and prepare responses
3. **Practice steel-manning** the preservation position
4. **Identify values** to acknowledge in star-manning
5. **Check arguments** for logical fallacies

## **Preservation Advocates - Internal Organization**

### **Same role structure as Adaptation group Additional considerations:**

- **Cultural sensitivity:** Ensure arguments don't stereotype any particular groups
- **Balance examples:** Include various cultural contexts, not just one tradition
- **Address practicality:** Acknowledge real-world challenges while maintaining position

## **Moderator/Synthesizer Group - Detailed Guidance**

**This group needs the most scaffolding as their role is most complex**

### **Specific roles within Moderator group:**

- **Discussion facilitator** (1): Manages flow, asks follow-up questions
- **Timekeeper** (1): Tracks time, signals transitions
- **Common ground identifier** (2): Listens for shared values and concerns
- **Question coordinator** (1): Manages clarifying question phase
- **Synthesis presenter** (1): Summarizes findings at end

### **Preparation tasks for Moderators:**

1. **Review both positions** thoroughly to understand key arguments
2. **Prepare transition phrases:** "Let's move to questions," "I'm hearing both sides value..."
3. **Identify potential areas of agreement:** Family importance, respect, contribution to community
4. **Prepare follow-up questions:** "Can you give a specific example?" "How might that work in practice?"
5. **Plan synthesis structure:** What format will you use to present common ground?

### **Moderator preparation questions:**

- What values do both positions seem to share?
  - Where might compromise or middle ground exist?
  - What questions could help clarify each side's reasoning?
  - How might both approaches work in different contexts?
- 

## **Physical Setup and Logistics**

### **Room Arrangement**

#### **Preparation phase (10 minutes):**

- **Clear three distinct areas** with adequate space for small group work
- **Provide materials:** Chart paper, markers, handouts for each group
- **Teacher circulation path:** Plan how you'll move between all three groups efficiently

#### **Discussion phase (20 minutes):**

- **Rearrange quickly:** Have students move chairs into discussion formation
- **Moderator positioning:** Central location where they can see all participants
- **Sight lines:** Ensure all students can see each other, not just teacher

### **Material Distribution**

#### **For all groups:**

- Discussion topic handout with position descriptions
- Civil Dialogue Template for note-taking
- Scratch paper for preparation notes

#### **Additional for Moderators:**

- List of potential synthesis questions
- Timing guide for discussion phases
- Common ground identification worksheet

### **Transition Management**

#### **From preparation to discussion:**

- **2-minute warning:** "Start wrapping up your preparation"
  - **Clear transition signal:** "Time to rearrange for our discussion"
  - **Efficient movement:** Give specific instructions for chair arrangement
  - **Materials management:** What to bring to discussion, what to leave behind
- 

## Teacher Circulation During Preparation

### Time allocation (10 minutes total):

- **Minutes 1-3:** Check in with Moderator group (they need most support)
- **Minutes 4-6:** Circulate between position groups
- **Minutes 7-9:** Final check with all groups, address questions
- **Minute 10:** Transition preparation

### Moderator group support priorities:

#### Common challenges and responses:

- **"We don't know what to do":** Refer to specific preparation tasks list
- **"How do we moderate?":** Practice transition phrases, explain timing
- **"What if people get upset?":** Role-play gentle redirection techniques

#### Key coaching points:

- **Your job isn't to have opinions** on the topic, but to help others express theirs
- **Ask genuine questions** to help clarify positions
- **Look for shared values** even when positions differ
- **Keep discussion respectful** by focusing on ideas, not people

### Position group support:

#### For both Adaptation and Preservation groups:

- **Check argument quality:** Are they avoiding fallacies?
- **Encourage steel-manning:** Can they fairly represent the other side?
- **Suggest specific examples:** Help them find concrete illustrations
- **Time management:** Are they dividing tasks effectively?

#### Red flags to address:

- Arguments that stereotype cultural groups

- Personal attacks or dismissive language about other position
  - Over-reliance on weak or fallacious reasoning
  - Failure to assign internal roles or divide tasks
- 

## Discussion Phase Management

### Moderator coaching during discussion:

#### Provide subtle support without taking over:

- **Hand signals:** Thumbs up for good facilitation, gentle redirect signals
- **Whispered suggestions:** Brief coaching during natural pauses
- **Step in only if necessary:** If discussion becomes disrespectful or unproductive

#### If Moderators struggle:

- **Provide sentence stems:** Write on board: "I'm hearing both sides value..."
- **Ask leading questions:** "Moderators, what common themes are you noticing?"
- **Share facilitation:** "Let me help the moderators by asking..."

### Supporting all students:

#### Encouraging participation:

- **Eye contact and nods** to affirm good contributions
- **Gentle prompts:** "Building on what [name] said..."
- **Process reminders:** Point to civil discourse techniques when you see them

#### Managing challenges:

- **Dominant speakers:** Work with moderators to encourage broader participation
  - **Quiet students:** Provide specific openings: "We haven't heard from this side yet"
  - **Off-topic drift:** Help moderators redirect: "Let's return to the main question"
- 

## Assessment and Observation Framework

### What to observe in each group:

#### Position groups:

- Quality of steel-manning and star-manning attempts

- Logical reasoning without fallacies
- Respectful engagement with opposing views
- Effective use of evidence and examples

**Moderator group:**

- Effective facilitation and time management
- Accurate identification of common ground
- Skillful question asking and redirection
- Synthesis quality and fairness

**Documentation method:**

**Simple observation sheet:**

- Student names by group
- Quick notes on skill demonstration
- Specific examples of effective civil discourse
- Areas needing reinforcement in future lessons

---

## Contingency Planning

**If discussion stalls:**

**Moderator prompts to suggest:**

- "Can you give us a specific example of that?"
- "What would that look like in practice?"
- "How might someone from the other side respond to that?"

**If discussion becomes heated:**

**Intervention strategies:**

1. **Pause and reset:** "Let's take a breath and remember our civil discourse goals"
2. **Refocus on skills:** "This is great practice for using our steel-manning techniques"
3. **Return to structure:** "Let's make sure we're following our discussion format"

**If groups finish preparation early:**

**Extension activities:**

- Practice steel-manning each other's arguments within the group

- Develop additional examples or evidence
- Prepare questions they'd like to ask the other side

**If groups need more preparation time:**

**Adjustment strategies:**

- Reduce discussion time slightly to allow for thorough preparation
  - Have groups share preparation progress to identify what's essential
  - Focus on quality over quantity of arguments
-