Lesson 6: Teacher Resource Sheet - From Pluralism to Civil Discourse Foundations

---

Core Civil Discourse Concepts

Civil Discourse Definition

Civil Discourse: Respectful exchange of ideas, especially when disagreeing

- Not just being polite or avoiding conflict
- Engaging honestly with different viewpoints
- Maintaining respect for persons while challenging ideas
- Seeking understanding rather than just winning

Key Distinctions to Teach

Civility vs. Politeness:

- **Politeness**: Avoiding offense, maintaining surface harmony
- **Civility**: Honest respect even in disagreement; engaging authentically with differences

Debate vs. Dialogue:

- **Debate**: Challenging ideas to test them; trying to prove your point
- **Dialogue**: Connecting perspectives to understand; exploring ideas together
- Both have value in different contexts

Core principle: People are more complex than any single position they hold
- **Avoid labeling**: "Someone who questions vaccine research" vs. "anti-vaxxer"
- **Avoid over-identification**: "I happen to support this policy" vs. "I am a [policy] person"
Why this matters:
- **Reduces defensiveness**: People can change minds without losing face
- **Enables learning**: Less threat to identity = more openness to new information
- **Prevents stereotyping**: Recognizes human complexity beyond single issues
Teaching examples:
- "Someone who prefers traditional teaching methods isn't necessarily 'anti-technology'"
- "Someone who supports stricter school rules isn't necessarily 'authoritarian'"
- "Someone who questions a school policy isn't necessarily 'against the school'"

Civility Self-Assessment Guidelines

Purpose and Framing

- **Baseline establishment**: Understanding current skill levels, not evaluation
- **Growth mindset**: Focus on development and improvement
- **Personal reflection**: Honest self-assessment for personal benefit
- **Skill building**: Foundation for targeted improvement

Administering the Survey

- **Emphasize honesty**: "There are no wrong answers - this helps you grow"
- **Avoid perfectionism**: "No one scores perfectly - we're all learning"
- **Private reflection**: "This is for your own understanding and development"
- **Connect to goals**: "This helps us focus on skills that matter in diverse settings"

Key Skills Covered

1. **Listening to understand** vs. listening to respond
2. **Openness** to different perspectives
3. **Respectful disagreement** without personal attacks
4. **Asking questions** vs. making assumptions
5. **Acknowledging merit** in opposing arguments
6. **Emotional awareness** and regulation
7. **Intellectual humility** and openness to being wrong

Digital Discourse Challenges

Unique Online Challenges

Absence of nonverbal cues:

- Can't see facial expressions, body language, tone
- Easy to misinterpret intent or emotion
- Missing context that would clarify meaning

Quick reaction culture:

- Pressure to respond immediately
- Less time for thoughtful consideration
- Impulse responses without reflection

Echo chambers:

- Algorithms show similar viewpoints

- Reduced exposure to different perspectives
- Reinforcement of existing beliefs

Anonymity effects:

- Reduced accountability for words
- Easier to dehumanize others
- Less empathy for real people behind screens

Online Opportunities

- **Connecting across differences**: Meeting people from different backgrounds
- **Access to diverse perspectives**: Global viewpoints available
- **Time for thoughtful response**: Can draft, edit, reflect before posting
- **Learning opportunities**: Access to information and educational content

Practical Applications

- **Pause before posting**: Read twice, post once
- **Assume good intent**: Give benefit of the doubt
- **Ask clarifying questions**: "Help me understand what you mean"
- **Focus on ideas**: Address arguments, not people

Steel-Manning and Star-Manning

Steel-Manning Explained

Definition: Presenting the strongest version of someone else's argument before responding

Why it matters:

- Shows respect for the other person's intelligence
- Ensures you're addressing their actual position
- Builds trust and credibility
- Leads to more productive discussions

How to do it:

1. Listen carefully to understand their position
2. Identify their strongest points and best evidence
3. Present their argument in its most compelling form
4. Only then offer your response or disagreement

Example:

- **Original**: "Students should use phones in class"
- **Straw-man** (what NOT to do): "You just want to text your friends during learning"
- **Steel-man**: "You believe phones can be valuable educational tools that prepare students for a digital world and provide access to information"

Star-Manning Explained

Definition: Acknowledging the good intentions, values, or goals behind a position you disagree with

Why it matters:

- Recognizes shared humanity and values
- Builds connection even in disagreement
- Reduces defensiveness in others
- Creates foundation for productive dialogue

How to do it:

1. Look beyond the position to underlying values
2. Identify positive motivations or goals
3. Acknowledge these genuinely
4. Then engage with the position itself

Example continuation:

- **Star-man addition**: "I appreciate that you want students to be prepared for the modern world and have access to learning tools"

Teaching Tips

- **Start with low-stakes examples**: School policies, not political issues
- **Model the techniques**: Demonstrate with student suggestions
- **Practice together**: Work through examples as a class
- **Connect to character strengths**: Links to fairness, perspective-taking, humility

---

Connection to Character Strengths

Direct Connections

Intellectual honesty: Steel-manning requires fairly representing others' views
Fairness: Giving others' arguments their due consideration
Perspective-taking: Understanding different viewpoints and motivations

Humility: Acknowledging that others may have valid points
Empathy: Recognizing good intentions behind different positions

Building on Previous Lessons

- **Human personality**: Civil discourse reflects our capacity for moral reasoning
- **Universal strengths**: These skills help communities thrive across cultural differences
- **Character development**: Practicing civil discourse builds virtue

---

Pluralism Connection

Why Pluralism Requires Civil Discourse

- **Diverse perspectives**: Different viewpoints naturally create potential for conflict
- **Shared decision-making**: Democratic processes require working together despite differences
- **Common ground**: Finding areas of agreement amid disagreement
- **Respectful coexistence**: Living together peacefully while holding different values

Preview of Skills Application

- **Next lessons**: Students will apply these skills to substantive disagreements
- **Real-world relevance**: These skills help navigate family, school, community, and civic discussions
- **Democratic participation**: Essential for effective citizenship in diverse society

---

Addressing Student Resistance

"This is too complicated/formal"

- **Response**: "Like any skill, it feels awkward at first but becomes natural with practice"
- **Analogy**: Learning to drive, play an instrument, or play a sport
- **Benefit focus**: "These skills help you be more persuasive and effective"

"Why can't we just say what we think?"

- **Response**: "You absolutely should express your views - this helps you do it more effectively"
- **Distinction**: "This isn't about changing what you believe, but how you engage with others"
- **Practical benefit**: "People are more likely to listen when you use these approaches"

"This won't work with [difficult people]"

- **Response**: "You're right that not everyone will respond positively, but these skills help you maintain your integrity regardless"
- **Control focus**: "You can only control your own behavior, not others' responses"
- **Character emphasis**: "This is about who you want to be, not about controlling outcomes"

Assessment and Skill Development

Observable Behaviors During Practice

- **Active listening**: Students asking clarifying questions before responding
- **Steel-manning**: Accurately representing others' positions
- **Star-manning**: Acknowledging positive motivations
- **Emotional regulation**: Staying calm during disagreement
- **Intellectual humility**: Acknowledging uncertainty or good points from others

Common Challenges

- **Reverting to debate mode**: Wanting to win rather than understand
- **Focusing on weak points**: Attacking easiest targets rather than strongest arguments
- **Getting emotional**: Losing focus on skills when topics feel personal
- **Performative civility**: Going through motions without genuine engagement

Skill Building Strategies

- **Start small**: Practice with low-stakes disagreements
- **Provide sentence stems**: "What I hear you saying is..." "I appreciate that you..."
- **Pause and reflect**: Build in thinking time during discussions
- **Celebrate progress**: Acknowledge good examples when you see them